An Overview of Key Community Aspirations for Ocean Beach, the Foreshore and Domain

> L&R New Zealand Ltd May 2009

# INTRODUCTION

The Dunedin City Council (DCC) has started gathering information which will be used to prepare a long-term plan to mitigate the erosion problems at Ocean Beach.

A significant aspect of this research is collecting historical, social and cultural information relating to the Ocean Beach area. An important component of this is identifying key community aspirations for Ocean Beach, the foreshore and Domain.

This report documents the key community aspirations of key stakeholders of this area.

Between November 2008 and February 2009, L&R New Zealand Ltd conducted 13 Key Stakeholder Meetings with individuals and groups that have interests in the Ocean Beach Domain.

178 key stakeholders (2 representatives from each organisation or household) were initially telephoned and then sent a written invitation to attend meetings. Key Stakeholder Groups were as follows:

- Ocean Beach Domain Occupiers (Lease Holders)
- Business/Property Owners on the St. Clair Esplanade
- Victoria Park Residents
- Home Owners between Victoria Road and Ocean Beach Domain
- Surf and Surf Lifesaving interests

In addition, a number of organisations were consulted on a one-to-one basis because of their particular nature, or circumstances at the time.

A summary of the community aspirations and issues of the various Key Stakeholder categories is provided in Section 1. The minutes of all meetings are in presented Appendix 2.

Section 2 of this report summarises the issues and aspirations of the organisations directly consulted. The notes of these meetings are in Appendix 3. Correspondence with the Department of Conservation is provided in Appendix 4.

Specific issues which relate to the future management of John Wilson Ocean Drive (JWOD) include the presence of wildlife and public access to Lawyers Head. Comments from the Department of Conservation and the Department of Psychological Medicine (Dunedin School of Medicine) are summarised and then discussed in Section 3.

Section 4 is a brief of the community aspirations identified in written submissions responding to the DCC's request for feedback on the proposed data collection process.

### SUMMARY

The following is a summary of key community aspirations for the Ocean Beach area identified from the series of Key Stakeholder meetings and written submissions:

All of the people (property owners, business owners, lessees) consulted recognised the importance of the Domain for coastal protection and that this is the priority in managing the area.

The community places a high value on the recreation opportunities in this area, and wishes it to remain a 'hub' for recreation. The attraction of this area is also its' open space quality and all of those consulted would like to see this maintained.

It is obvious that the draw card for the public is primarily proximity to the sea and access to the beach and coastline (including St. Clair to St. Kilda track and JWOD). Many people want to see public access throughout the Domain increased. An extension of a coastal track to Tomahawk Beach, which begins south of St. Clair (BlackHead / Tunnel Beach / Cargill's Castle / Second Beach) is also desired.

The public's vision for the use and look of the Domain, foreshore and beach falls into two distinct categories.

#### Wilderness Aesthetics

Many value the area for its aesthetics (especially the ambience from the beach) – a wilderness landscape close to the city. Management and development of this area should retain the freedom to walk uninterrupted along the entire Ocean Beach, and enhance the area's beauty. The beach should be left unmodified as a single stretch of beach (important for the aesthetics of the area and ease of walking/running). Solutions to erosion issues and future development need to be harmonious with the natural and wilderness aesthetics of the coastal environment (beach and dune). Soft landscaping options for erosion management (plantings and reinstating an active dune system) are favoured over structural solutions. Provision of recreation opportunities should focus on casual recreation – e.g. a variety of track surfaces to provide opportunities for differing abilities and interests (including uses such as walking/running/cycling), playgrounds, and increased access throughout the Domain. Erosion management options could incorporate sports field removal and track development in some areas.

#### Formal Landscape

Other people, predominantly those with sporting interests and residents, would like the development of the area to be formal, with the focus on providing for public use. All ability walkways along the dune system (boardwalks / esplanades / sea wall) could be constructed. Development of the area should also include permissible businesses that enhance public use – e.g. cafés, tourism attractions, etc. The Domain should continue to provide for formal recreation – i.e. sports fields, clubs.

The following list highlights other key issues that were identified during community consultation.

- Public use of Domain enhanced with signage, maps and interpretation. This should include a sign at Middle Beach warning of the danger of swimming there. In addition, better signage at Chisholm Park Golf Course may reduce conflict between public track users and golfers
- Promote all recreation opportunities of the beach and Domain Ocean Beach as a destination
- Leasees would like to remain on the Domain
- Extension of railway
- Plantings to enhance aesthetics of area and assist with mitigating coastal erosion
- Long distance track from Cargill's Castle (or Blackhead) to Tomahawk (and consideration of how track would go through/around Chisholm Golf Course)
- Better management of rubbish beach/Domain/playgrounds/Esplanade
- Access along JWOD and onto Lawyers Head for exercise, and ability to park car and look at views of city and beach, and to access surf break (some of community believe vehicle access is important)
- Find ways to mitigate the negative issues of public access along JWOD
- Traffic 'calming' islands installed along JWOD
- Reinstall St. Clair to St. Kilda track as very popular, and an alternative to walking on beach at high tide or stormy conditions
- Provide access to Middle Beach near Moana Rua Rd
- Ability to walk dogs on beach
- Ensure needs of surfers are met as they add to vibrancy of this coastal area
- Provision of adequate car parking
- Increased seating along tracks and JWOD
- An additional public ramp to the one used by the St. Clair Surf Lifesaving Club
- Better access to St. Clair beach when sand level is low
- Continue clearing away any rubble and steel when exposed along all foreshore

### **SECTION 1 : KEY STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS**

#### **Meeting Process:**

Attendees of Key Stakeholder Meetings were advised the following:

- the DCC has started gathering information which will be used to prepare a longterm plan to mitigate the coastal erosion problems at Ocean Beach.
- A significant aspect of this research is collecting historical, social and cultural information relating to the Ocean Beach area. An important component of this is identifying key community aspirations for Ocean Beach, the foreshore and Domain.

In addition:

• A Council representative updated attendees on progress of research to date. However, the main aim was to provide an opportunity for stakeholders to express their interests in this area, and any issues or suggestions that they wished to be taken into account when developing the long-term plan.

Posters used in the presentation are provided in Appendix 1.

#### **Meeting Outcomes:**

The minutes of all meetings are presented in Appendix 2. These minutes are summarised below.

#### **Ocean Beach Domain Occupiers (i.e. Lease holders)**

<u>Meeting Comments:</u> Many of the lease holders that occupy the Ocean Beach Domain recognise the importance of this area for coastal protection, and that this is a priority for management.

Occupation of the Domain for many leasees was established decades ago. These groups have a long established connection with the area and have invested a significant amount of finances into their infrastructure. Organisations are concerned that they could not afford to relocate if the land they occupy was required for managing erosion issues. Most leasees are clubs operating on a non-profit basis with limited finances.

Occupying council administered land is cheaper than having to rent commercial land. Some organisations well established on the Domain fear termination of their lease would bring about their demise.

The recent implementation of a one-year lease means many organisations are unable to secure funding for maintenance and development. In addition, many are reluctant to invest in infrastructure with no security of tenure. All stated that the current situation is unsatisfactory.

For a few of the organisations occupying the Domain, the benefit of the location is simply occupying a suitable building. The sporting organisations value the excellent condition of the sand based (hence well drained) fields. For other groups, such as the Scouts, Harriers, and the Te Whanau Arohanui Trust, the Domain is pivotal for their activities – using the area's tracks, beach, general open space and natural values. For some sporting groups, the proximity of the Domain to lower socio-economic areas is also seen by some groups as being a benefit of their location. Furthermore, many of the sporting organisations cater for their local community.

The organisations that rely on the general public for income (the family amusement amenities at St. Kilda) rely on the 'recreation package' of opportunities at Ocean Beach; *i.e. being adjacent to other attractions including playgrounds and the beach itself.* 

The popularity of the area means that clubs are visible to non-members, and this exposure may generate more membership.

Overall, the lessees' vision of the area is to continue to enhance the Domain's open space values and its perception as a hub of formal and casual recreation opportunities. Increased freedom of movement through the Domain by developing public tracks (including access from Tainui to the beach) is seen as desirable. A track would provide older children and adults with recreation opportunities – especially if it allows cycling. A track could include Second Beach and Cargill's Castle. The visual beauty of the beach and the ability to walk along it uninterrupted is part of the beach's appeal.

Maps and information panels explaining history, various areas, access points, etc. would add to the public's understanding and use of the area. More rubbish bins are needed at key locations.

JWOD is an important attraction of the Domain and the recent closure of the road is a loss of a city asset. Vehicle access along this road and onto Lawyers Head is an important use of this area. Parking for people recreating in the St. Kilda area is difficult on busy days now that the majority of JWOD is closed.

Any proposed planting adjacent to existing facilities should be considered, in terms of vegetative shading and leaves dropping on club grounds.

There are specific issues concerning the Otago Railway and Locomotive Society:

- Society generates tourism in city as people come specifically to look at historic and rare locomotives
- location on Domain is excellent as the provision is one of a number of attractions in immediate area – thus good for tourism (and the Society's income)
- the security of being located on the Domain and the potential for the railway tracks to be extended has been discussed by Council for many years without resolution
- from a business perspective, lack of security of tenure has stalled progress as they cannot develop area
- funding for site development is available waiting for decision on long-term future in this location.
- difficulty and expense of moving heavy and large machinery if they were required to relocate
- the Society's very keen for their ambitions (for the railway track to be extended into other areas of the Domain) to be incorporated with erosion management solutions

• two building projects are planned – which will enable the yards to be kept tidy

### **Business/Property Owners on the St. Clair Esplanade**

Meeting Comments:

(Unfortunately only one of the 12 business and business property owners invited to the key stakeholder meetings attended. However, the attendee does own a number of properties and businesses on the Esplanade.)

The wilderness of the coastal environment of Ocean Beach is a unique city asset. Ocean Beach is a natural wonder and any solution to erosion issues and development of this area should recognise that aesthetics are important.

Casual recreational use of the beach and tracks along the foreshore is important. The variety of surfaces from the Esplanade, St. Clair to St. Kilda track and then JWOD provides variation and opportunities for all abilities. The current closure of JWOD is depriving the public of a city asset. It is important that vehicle access to Lawyers Head is reinstated so all people can enjoy that area.

JWOD should form part of a coastal walkway that eventually runs from Blackhead to Tomahawk Lagoon. Land acquisition should work towards this outcome.

Public input with planting etc. would encourage community support for developments.

# **Victoria Park Residents**

Meeting Comments:

For residents of Victoria Park, an important aspect of their community is the close proximity of the beach, domain land and open space values.

The importance of the dune area for coastal protection is paramount. Development of the area to mitigate erosion should consider retaining as much recreational use for the public as possible. Recreational activities add to the vibrancy and could be developed to encourage more people to the area. Suggestions include: more cafés at St. Kilda, train line extension, more areas to walk and making the area attractive with planting of native trees and tidying up of certain areas. Some residents thought that the attractions at Ocean Beach should be jointly promoted as a tourist destination.

Sand blowing onto the properties and houses in Victoria Park is an issue for residents, particularly those closer to the beach.

JWOD provides important recreation opportunities. Many regularly walk along this road (an alternative to a more active beach walk) for exercise – noting that the walk onto Lawyers Head is the only uphill one in the locality. Residents also drive visitors along the Drive onto Lawyers Head for views of the city. Some consider that the length of JWOD currently accessible to vehicles is not enough to cater for the popular use of looking at the coastline (and eating lunch or dinner) from the car. Since the closure of JWOD, 'boy racers' now use Victoria Road and thus are still a problem for residents in this area. Night closure and traffic 'calming' islands were suggested as ways to manage this problem.

Access along the beach and dunes is an important recreation activity for residents. The track along the dunes from St. Clair to St. Kilda was well used and residents want to see it reinstated. The variation of surfaces from the Esplanade, along the dune track and JWOD is welcomed by residents. Some residents commented that the current beach access points are too steep and the wooden slats are difficult to walk on.

The hub of recreational activity is seen as a positive attribute of this area. Residents like the busyness of the sports grounds and the family amenities at St. Kilda. The presence of locomotives on the Domain is met with mixed feelings by residents. Many see the historic trains as contributing to the vibrancy of the area, and think the track should be extended to Lawyers Head and towards St. Clair. The yards to store the trains are messy, however, and residents ask that trees be planted to create a visual barrier.

### Home Owners between Victoria Road and Ocean Beach Domain

Meeting Comments:

Property owners between Victoria Road and the Ocean Beach Domain recognise that the priority for managing the foreshore and Domain is to protect property in South Dunedin from the sea. Protection of property is more important than retaining land for formal recreation that could likely be accommodated elsewhere in the city. It was noted in one meeting that house insurance does not cover inundation from the sea.

Residents' opinions differ regarding their vision for the Domain. All recognise that the beach and Domain are major city assets – and very popular even in the winter. Many value the area for its' natural values and informal recreation opportunities, and believe it is important to enhance and preserve the aesthetics of the beach and dunes. The ability to walk uninterrupted along the beach is also key to the attractiveness of the area. This area is a free resource and a playground for many and various land or water based users. Dog walking is a popular activity on this beach.

Others' vision is for an extended esplanade, board walks, historic train track extension, more cafés and increased recreation opportunities, family attractions and tourism provision.

Surfing is considered to be an important aspect of St. Clair, and therefore residents consider it essential that surfing needs are met (access, preservation or enhancement of surf breaks).

Residents value the open space ambience of the Domain and are generally receptive to the area's popularity as the city's 'recreation hub', feeling it adds to its vibrancy. Many residents expressed their concern regarding long-term solutions to mitigate erosion, fearful that solutions may require their homes be removed. Another concern is the lack of car parking on busy days. The ability to walk and drive along JWOD is a positive attribute of the Domain. Few residents mentioned Lawyers Head in terms of a location for suicide. Two residents suggested vehicle restrictions along JWOD and Wright Memorial lookout on Lawyers Head. Other residents strongly believed that car access to the lookout is important for tourism and for people unable to walk there. Many believe that vehicle access along JWOD (or at least an increased length than currently available) should be reinstated. Vehicular use of JWOD allows surfers easy access to the Lawyers Head end of the beach, and provides more parking space for those taking in the spectacular views. Rubbish along JWOD is a problem.

The track from St. Clair to St. Kilda is highly used and valued by residents. Property owners immediately behind the track would be concerned if any development in the area compromised their privacy. Planting of vegetation for coastal protection should be extensive and would improve aesthetics of the area. Seating along the track would also be a positive development. Some residents thought the track should be improved to accommodate pushchairs and wheelchairs, while others thought that the Esplanade and JWOD provided for such users, and the variation of surfaces along the foreshore should be maintained. Beach access at Middle Beach is seen as desirable, as currently people can get trapped on St. Clair Beach on an incoming tide. A track extending from Second Beach to Tomahawk was suggested.

The wooden 'slat and chain' foot surfaces at access points are not popular as these are difficult to walk on.

*Issues and concerns relating to the Esplanade include:* 

- graffiti
- empty property lots looking untidy and could be used temporarily for car parking
- value of existing green spaces
- rubbish on the beach
- parking issues
- wheelchair ramp not in appropriate place
- when sand level is low it is difficult for elderly and pushchairs etc. to get on and off steps and ramp
- skateboarders
- access to the beach after sea wall ends
- above pool loss of view with solid wall and no provision of promised seating
- shark bell sign needs to be reinstated for safety (as people ring it not knowing its purpose)
- hazard of rocks on beach for swimmers
- *public toilets*
- traffic flow is an issue dangerous situation with playground opposite café and cars travelling in between
- algae on steps and ramp

# Surf and Surf Lifesaving Interests

Meeting Comments:

A groyne or breakwater at Ocean Beach would be beneficial to surfers. However, the natural state of Ocean Beach is more valued. Surfers recognise that a breakwater would ruin these aesthetics. The naturalness of the area is part of its attraction, making it an important city asset. An artificial break structure is not crucial to Dunedin's surfing reputation, as Dunedin has many great surf breaks. From a surf lifesaving perspective the breakwaters do not create a significant safety issue.

It is believed that it would be difficult for an underwater reef to work at Ocean Beach because of extreme storm conditions that frequently occur here. Durban (South Africa) and some places on the east coast of Australia experience similar conditions.

Surf and Surf Lifesavers believe the curvature and 'stacking' of sections of the new sea wall have created a number of adverse effects. Sand denudation and rips along the sea wall make the steps and boat ramp difficult to use. In addition, when sand levels are low, the lifesaving boats cannot easily be moved on and off the boat ramp. Exposed rocks also contribute to the hazards of entering and exiting the sea in front of the Esplanade.

The general public's use of the St. Clair Surf Lifesaving Club boat ramp to launch boats and jet skis causes congestion problems on the ramp and access area. An alternative public ramp at Ocean Beach would be a solution (e.g. Lawyers Head end of beach – as already there is an existing car park and can be sheltered in some conditions).

Although it is recognised that swimming at Middle Beach is not safe, the surf lifesaving club think that access from the Domain to the beach at this location is important. Signage explaining the dangers of swimming there should be installed. The lifesaving patrol regularly moves along the beach to check this area. The current lack of access at Middle Beach is dangerous as people get caught on the beach at high tide. In addition, rubble and steel are sometimes exposed in the sand bank, and add to the dangers at this site.

Car access along JWOD is important for surfers as there is sometimes a surf break off Lawyers Head. Car access is also important for walkers and runners. The increasing lack of availability of car parks at the Esplanade to look out to sea enhances the importance of JWOD as an alternative place to do this. Car access to the top of Lawyers Head is not so important, but pedestrian access should remain. Obviously pollution from the sewage outfall is of concern to surfers.

The walking track from St. Clair to St. Kilda is a great asset for the public. It is an important walking alternative, at high tide.

*St. Kilda Surf Lifesaving Club has difficulty with the soft sand when launching and landing their rescue boats.* 

The existing green spaces in the Esplanade area add to the aesthetics and open space values. Car parking is an issue for residents with many considering applying for resident only spaces. It is important from a surfing perspective that there is no time restriction for parking cars, as often surfers are out on the water for more than two hours. The redevelopment of the Esplanade has reduced the number of car parks and the increase in businesses has meant more café/bar staff park in these spaces. The absence of changing rooms in the area means surfers must use the car park for this purpose.

Rubbish is a problem in the area on busy days. The beach, Esplanade and playground are problematic areas. More rubbish bins, regular emptying, patrolling, fines and perhaps people employed to pick up rubbish on busy days are some ways to resolve this problem.

Dogs on the beach are not seen as a problem. Dog walkers are often seen picking up other people's rubbish.

### **SECTION 2 : DIRECT CONSULTATION**

A number of organisations were consulted on a one-to-one basis because of their particular nature, or circumstances at the time.

The following organisations were consulted directly. Minutes of meetings are provided in Appendix 3. These organisation's comments are summarised below.

# Kai Tahu ki Otago (KTKO)

<u>KTKO Comments (in brief):</u>

As detailed in the KTKO 'Natural Resource Management Plan 2005', there is a legal framework for Kai Tahu ki Otago involvement in resource management; including the:

- Resource Management Act 1991 (pgs. 48-51)
- Conservation Act 1987 (pgs. 50-51)
- Local Government Act 2002 (pg. 52)
- Foreshore and Seabed Act 2004 (pgs. 52-53)
- *Reserves Act 1977 (pg. 53)*
- and other legislation (pg. 53)

It is acknowledged that Maori (prior to European Settlement) used trails along the Ocean beach sand dunes to link the Otago Peninsula with Forbury Head. Remains of Maori ovens have been found throughout this area. It is considered unlikely that there was a substantial or permanent Maori village on the sand dunes.

KTKO see it as important that they are kept informed of progress throughout the process of developing long-term solutions to erosion issues. KTKO must be consulted after options for long-term solutions are being short listed and before any erosion mitigation measures are implemented.

# **Dunedin Ice Stadium**

Dunedin Ice Stadium Comments (in brief):

The Dunedin Ice Stadium's location on the Domain is of less importance than other public recreational facilities which benefit from a 'package' of recreation opportunities in the area. However, some parents do drop children off to skate while they walk on the beach or have a drink or dinner at the St. Clair Esplanade. The Dunedin Ice Stadium utilises the nearby Tahuna Holiday Park for accommodation during events.

The majority of Ice Stadium users are from the more affluent suburbs of Dunedin, not necessarily the neighbouring communities.

Management do not perceive a negative impact from being located in a coastal environment. However, comments from City Property (DCC), who are the landlord and responsible for external maintenance, have to periodically remove large quantities of sand from the building's guttering. Ice Stadium management are not concerned if some of Kettle Park is used to reinstate an active dune system (if this is a management solution to erosion). Car parking is the major management issue for this facility. Badminton Hall users park in the Ice Stadium's car park. Management believe this deters customers as they think the Ice Stadium is busy.

The adjacent Marlow Park Car Park provides spin-off benefits for the stadium. Formal users of this car park (e.g. ACC motorbike training, marching and miniature car racing) often get the Ice Stadium to provide food. This car park is also used to full capacity during events and shows at the Stadium (sometimes it is necessary that Forbury Car Park is used as well).

### **Chisholm Park Golf Course**

Chisholm Park Golf Course Comments (in brief):

Since the temporary closure of JWOD the upkeep of the golf course has been a lot easier and there has been less vandalism. Prior to this closure, rubbish on the golf course was common (this includes seagulls dropping cartons of fast food on golf course to break open to eat). Also problematic was vandalism to the clubrooms, theft of green flags (up to 55 a year), vandalism of rubbish bins on golf course, and cars crashing off the road (average of about 3 a year).

Boy racers create noise pollution for golfers and as, stated above, contribute to cars occasionally crashing down the landward bank.

However, access to JWOD and Lawyers Head can also be economically beneficial for the golf club. Many people (including visitors to Dunedin) decide to play golf after seeing the course and its magnificent views.

Public use of the pedestrian track that runs through the golf course can be problematic. This track is used by walkers, runners and sometimes mountain bikers. The track is also used to walk dogs and push children's buggies. There are a number of sites where the track crosses fairways and there is little visibility between golfers and track users. On occasions the public do not wait until golfers have finished their shots before crossing the fairway. The golf club is not averse to the public using the track, but, this a potentially dangerous situation. The Club believes that better signage would mitigate this problem.

Any track development that links Tomahawk with JWOD or the existing track through the golf course would need to cross the golf course at some stage. This could increase the potential for conflict between walkers and golfers.

#### **DCC** – Water and Waste Services

DCC Water and Waste Services Comments (in brief):

Stage One of the Tahuna Waste Water Treatment Plant Upgrade was completed in March 2009. This involved the construction of a temporary pier to install the outfall pipe. The resource consent for this stage requires that all earth works structures are temporary and will be removed when the works are completed. The resource consent also states that temporary damage to the dunes will be rectified once work is completed.

Stage Two of the upgrade involves work to the treatment station itself. As part of the proposed upgrade a designated boundary within the boundaries of Tahuna Park has been permitted. Land not required will be returned to the Community and Recreation Services (CARS) Department to continue to be administered as part of Tahuna Park. However, the land requirements for options under consideration make it unlikely that there will be any residual designated area returned to CARS

This stage of the upgrade is scheduled for completion in 2011.

#### **DCC – Community and Recreation Services – Sports fields and Facilities Officer** *DCC Sports fields and Facilities Officer Comments (in brief):*

The sports fields of Kettle Park are well used for rugby, soccer, school competitions and other activities such as cross country. Local soccer clubs state that the proximity of fields to lower socio-economic communities is an important part of the fields' value.

The Dunedin City Council will determine whether the level of sports field use supported by the Domain can be accommodated by transfer to other existing sports grounds in Dunedin. This research is necessary in case long-term solutions to erosion issues include the removal of sports fields from the Domain.

There are a number of possible changes that could be made to areas of the Domain to better accommodate sporting interests.

Current issues relating to erosion and Kettle Park include sand being blown onto the field, and people walking across the field now that the dune track is closed. Walkers, however, do not adversely affect the field (as the sandy ground does not compact) nor the fields formal use (as people do not walk on the field when a game is being played).

# DCC – City Property

DCC City Property Comments (in brief):

There are approximately 50 flats in the elderly peoples housing estate (EPH) between Victoria Road and the Ocean Beach Domain. These units are never empty for long, as the flat surrounding area and proximity to South Dunedin shops makes this location very popular.

A key issue for City Property with regard to the long-term solution to erosion, is that they be kept informed of the progress so they can inform tenants.

If EPH housing needs to be removed as part of a long-term erosion solution, alternative accommodation is currently unavailable elsewhere. Any replacement units would need to be provided on a similar site – i.e. flat / close to amenities.

City Property has no long-term plans to change this area.

### **DCC – Aquatic Services**

DCC Aquatic Services Comments (in brief):

The beach and Domain are important community assets that provide the overall seaside and recreational ambience of the area. The St. Clair Salt Water Pool is an important component of this, as are the bars and restaurants at the Esplanade.

The open air design of the pool (with views of the sea/beach and Esplanade) adds to users' experience, and is for many a key attraction of the pool. Part of the attraction is the natural beauty of the area. This could be further enhanced by focussing Domain development on providing for casual recreation. This could be incorporated into erosion management solutions and could include the removal of sports fields and creating tracks through dunes. Tracks should be for walkers only and would also be used by the public when the tide is high or stormy weather. The ability to walk uninterrupted along the entire Ocean Beach is part of the area's natural beauty.

The Domain could continue to be developed to provide more visitor attractions – including development of the historic trains. The hub of children's activities at St. Kilda contributes to the attraction of the area. A 'car free' esplanade would make this area more user friendly.

### SECTION 3 : DEPARTMENT OF CONSERVATION AND UNIVERSITY OF OTAGO PSYCHOLOGY DEPARTMENT COMMENTS AND DISCUSSION

# Department of Conservation (DOC) – Otago Conservancy

DOC's Comments (in brief):

The eastern section of Ocean Beach between the temporary pier and Lawyers Head (during the period it was closed to public access) has provided a safer habitat for sea lions and breeding oyster catchers. Both species are generally intolerant of disturbance by humans. In addition, Lawyers Head provides breeding habitat for red-billed gulls (their threat classification is 'nationally vulnerable') and white fronted terns (classified as being 'in decline') and spotted shags. Furthermore, the area is also occasionally used by yellow-eyed and little blue penguins.

DOC recommends that the Council's management focus be on recreational opportunities that do not directly conflict with wildlife and habitat values. DOC considers that unrestricted public use of this eastern section of Ocean Beach will have an adverse affect on indigenous fauna and flora. Therefore, DOC recommends that council considers restricting or prohibiting dog access to this area and, also prohibiting vehicles on the beach and dune areas.

Fishing off Lawyers Head may adversely affect nesting birds, and DOC suggests defining areas where fishing is and isn't allowed.

Signage explaining any imposed restrictions in terms of the ecological values in the area is also recommended.

Discussion:

Ocean Beach is Dunedin's main city beach – regularly used by the people of greater Dunedin. Various recreational uses include walking along the length of the beach (popular for dog walking), and the use of JWOD to access Lawyers Head and the beach.

A popular use of JWOD is to view the sea from a vehicle (an important passive recreational opportunity for those with limited time, reduced mobility, and an option on a stormy day).

The issue of future public access at Ocean Beach should be addressed in consideration of both high recreational use and the presence of wildlife.

When DOC provided a written submission to the DCC in February 2008, it noted that "... usage that have occurred post construction include oyster catchers successfully raising chicks there this breeding season, whilst the Lawyers Head end of the beach has been consistently used by New Zealand sealions ...". The exact number of oyster catchers nesting successfully and the degree of the presence of NZ sealions has not been detailed by DOC. However, Spiralis Ltd has undertaken an ecological assessment as part of the Ocean Beach data collection process, and this will provide more detail.

The proximity of Ocean Beach to the city provides easy access for residents and visitors. DOC states that this proximity contributes to the area's significance and that with

appropriate management, the eastern section of Ocean Beach can contribute to Dunedin's reputation for wildlife.

Ocean Beach is popular for people exercising dogs. There are limited opportunities for this in the greater Dunedin area. Other beaches have restrictions placed on public access because of their high ecological values. The length of Ocean Beach provides adequate scope for exercising dogs, even if restrictions were imposed at the eastern end to mitigate the disruption to wildlife. Such restrictions (at the eastern end of the beach) might range from total prohibition of dogs to only permitting dogs on leads, or a seasonal ban (depending on the presence of wildlife).

JWOD is a formed road providing immediate access to the dune system. DOC recommends that vehicles are prohibited on the dunes (not the road) and beach to protect flora and fauna. Limited beach access points for pedestrians, and signs to explain reasons for restrictions, would also be beneficial.

#### **Keren Skegg (Senior Lecturer in Psychological Medicine, University of Otago)** *Keren Skegg's Comments (in brief):*

Keren Skegg has recently completed a study of suicide and call-outs at Lawyers Head comparing the 10 years prior to closure of JWOD with the 2 years during which the road has been closed. Results of this study show that there were 13 deaths in the 10 years prior to road closure and no deaths during the two year study (one person did jump but survived). There was an average of 19.3 call-outs per year prior to closure of JWOD and 9.5 per year during the two-year study.

Skegg considers that the gate is a more important deterrent to potential jumpers than the presence of a guard – although the presence of a guard may have a preventative effect.

Although it is unknown how far from Lawyer's Head the gate needs to act as an effective deterrent to potential jumpers, Skegg considers that the current positioning of the gate is effective.

If it is not possible to deny the public access along JWOD then Skegg considers the next best restriction would be to allow pedestrian access and only during the day (as having to walk to a destination may give people contemplating suicide time to reconsider).

#### Discussion:

In April 2008 a non-public report was presented to the Community Development Committee (DCC) in relation to Lawyers Head and the issue of suicide. It is discussed in relation to access along JWOD, in terms of the recreational importance of this road, including policy and management of the area stated in the 1992 Ocean Beach Domain Management Plan and the Reserves Act 1977.

Lawyers Head and John Wilson Ocean Drive have important community recreation and scenic values (as detailed in the current management plan), and are important Dunedin amenities close to urban areas and the city centre.

In March/April 2009 the continued closure of JWOD has generated a number of letters to the Editor of the ODT. This highlights the importance of access to the Drive and headland to the Dunedin community. In addition, meetings with key stakeholders of this area (this report) show that JWOD is frequently used by locals and an asset to the community.

Since the April 2008 CDC report, the DCC (City Planning Department) has obtained legal advice regarding formed roads over reserve land and thus legal status of these roads. This advice has direct relevance to the legal status of JWOD and thus public consultation requirements if Council decides to restrict public access along this road.

Public attention associating suicide with particular locations (especially iconic places) is considered detrimental, as it appears such attention encourages imitative behaviour. Any restrictions on public access along JWOD will create public debate (as has already begun to occur), and in doing so may have a harmful effect that counteracts any benefit from installing a barrier.

#### **SECTION 4 : WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS**

Fifty-one submissions were received in response to the DCC's programme of data and information collection.

The following information is taken from a DCC report prepared for the Ocean Beach Hearings Committee (20-23 April 2008) by the Reserves Planning and Policy Officer (Dolina Lee).

### Submission question: What submitters value about the Ocean Beach Area.

Thirty-five submitters responded to the question, and many included several values; therefore there are more than 35 responses. They are summarised as follows:

#### **Recreation Value**

Nine submitters appreciate the recreation values of Ocean Beach. Of those, two value the recreation values of the beach itself, three the wider recreation area and four do not specify. Twelve submitters mention walking and/or jogging as specific activities and two of those also mention walking their dog.

Aquatic recreation is specifically mentioned by 14 submitters. Six specify surfing, two mention the "surfy waves", three specify swimming, two mention surf lifesaving and one mentions activities such as kayaking and fishing.

#### **Amenity Values**

Seventeen submitters recognise the amenity, visual amenity and naturalness of the area and five specifically mention the wildlife. Six submitters mention the quality of the sand and two specifically mention the sand dunes.

Twenty submitters value the area's proximity to the city and accessibility. Accessibility is mentioned both in terms of the range of ages that can use the beach, and the fact that it is accessible at all times of the year. Five submitters say that the area is an "asset to the city" and two mention the tourism potential of the area. One submitter values the Esplanade and saltwater pool.

Two groups appreciate the area for the activities that are available on it.

Three submitters mention the "buffer" the area provides from the sea.

# Comment

It is clear that Ocean Beach is perceived as valuable because of its proximity to the city. It is an accessible coastal area that has high amenity values and provides many recreational opportunities for the residents of, and visitors to, the city. This information will be passed on to the Emergency Response Team so it can be included in the decision making process for the long-term plan.

# **Appendix 1: Key Stakeholder Meeting Posters**

### Poster 1

Ocean Beach Long-Term Planning Process

(to find a long-term solution to the coastal erosion problems at Ocean Beach)

### Key Stakeholders Meetings

(to gain an understanding of community values and aspirations for the beach and dune system)

### Poster 2

Main Aims of Meeting

- 1. For Council to understand what key stakeholders value in this area and their aspirations / vision for the beach and dune system (purpose / use / aesthetics)
- 2. To gather any issues or suggestions that you wish to be taken into account when Council develops a long-term plan.
- 3. Re: the beach and dune systems relating to erosion issues

#### Poster 3

- **Purpose** of beach and dune system includes: coastal protection / public use / ecological
- **Use** includes: various recreation uses of beach and dune system / access to beach / casual recreation / organised recreation / access through dune system
- Aesthetics the overall look / ambience of the beach and dune environment

# **Appendix 2: Minutes of Key Stakeholder Meetings**

# Meeting 1: Home Owners between OBD and Victoria Rd

Date: 24 November 2008

Location: Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive)

Attendees:

- George and Pauline Strong
- Ray and Moyra Brown
- Chris and Maria Menzies
- Greg Sligo (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

Absent:

- Ernest Mains
- Nelson Cottle
- Eunice O'Gorman and Denise Kelly
- James and Fiona McKay

- Chris number one priority is to protect South Dunedin from the sea
- Chris houses are not insured for sea invasion so protection is important
- George any man-made structure in the past hasn't lasted including wood and chain access surfaces
- George the important factor is to implement management options that work (not just opting for the cheapest option). Don't extend sand dune because cheapest option if it isn't going to work
- plantings are good not just Pikao but also trees
- Ray concentrate on spending money to protect houses recreation lease holders are not as important as home owners
- Chris would like to see an esplanade along the foreshore from seawall to St. Kilda (if this was more natural looking then that is OK). But would prefer a path that people with push chairs etc. can use) similar look to esplanades in Australia
- George and Pauline want a natural look
- (note/ the Strong's and the Menzies differ only in opinion of aesthetics i.e. both see key purpose of area as coastal protection that is effective – if possible tied in with community use)
- Moyra planting trees to help catch sand
- Chris Railway and extension is good for tourism
- Ray believes the erosion issues have been made worse by placement of new rocks by the pool – now a lot less sand
- Chris Outfall Pier is good for surfing but sewage still going into the sea is not acceptable
- access to beach is very important as a popular area in the city
- surfers are important and access for them is important
- important to maintain privacy for houses between houses and beach that is not to put track so public can see these houses
- tourism and beach recreation is important important that people can walk along

the entire beach uninterrupted

- Children's Park on Esplanade is extremely popular and the road between this and shops needs to be pedestrian only (even if only at some times). Hotels and car parking still along sea front
- algae a problem on the ramp
- Chris seating along beach track would be good
- Chris likes the idea of a more formal look. Recreation is important but is secondary to coastal protection
- George likes idea of trees/plantings with track running through the less formal look
- Chris if Esplanade is extended then the existing recreation facilities behind existing dune can remain
- Ray immediate priority is to repair and build up the area that has slipped to enable track along sand dune to be reinstated
- Shark nets important for them to stay.

# Meeting 2: Home Owners between OBD and Victoria Rd

Date: 25 November 2008

Location: Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive)

# Attendees:

- John Barr
- Peter Haslemore
- Jan Lawence
- Jocelyn Malcolmson
- Greg Sligo (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

# Absent:

- Ernest and Alwynne MacKenzie
- Margaret and Fleur Yorston
- Andrew Berkert
- Daniel Gillion

- erosion and coastal protection is very important
- Esplanade area is now very good
- end of the Esplanade looks very bad and track is rough and impassable where slipped
- erosion area is an eyesore
- a lot of tourists come to this area and it is not a good look for Dunedin reputation
- would like to see some form of sea wall built as would be a shame to see recreation ground sacrificed – and also expensive to remove rubble
- is a very nice beach and excellent quality of sand
- the edge of current dune is not a natural boundary and therefore it will be difficult to prevent erosion with only planting
- track from St. Clair to St. Kilda is a very important asset
- landward side of track needs more vegetation for aesthetics and coastal protection

   needs to look good from beach
- need more notices and patrolling re: dog fouling around area and especially Esplanade
- great potential for the area for casual recreation
- a few more seats facing the sea along track and JWOD would be good
- pool end of Esplanade not enough dog signs these need to be near car park
- water quality is a big negative issue in this area and should be treated as a priority
- the beach is a major asset to the city because of its proximity to city it is very well used even in the winter.
- the area is used by a lot of various users it is a free resource and is a playground (including the water)
- protect the sand dunes so we cannot see the rubble fill the rubble is a hazard (use and aesthetics)
- wheelchair ramp is not in an appropriate place
- Esplanade suffers from graffiti / skateboarders and rubbish the high use of this

area means rubbish is a problem on busy days

- maybe bins need to be on beach after a busy day the beach is left in a bad way Council needs to enforce some by-laws
- empty private lot between Salt and Starfish is an eyesore and owners should be asked to tidy it up. Perhaps use as a car park in the meantime
- an artificial reef would be good if viable
- need to take force out of waves
- don't want the whole beach area to look like the Gold Coast
- recent development of Esplanade is good but car parking is an issue
- want to see a sustainable sand dune system working even if it encroaches on Kettle Park
- concern regarding possible purchase and disposal of private properties in the longterm
- if the sand dunes were reinstated and therefore a large wilderness area concern regarding misbehaviour (vandalism etc.)
- if seawall was extended it would provide extra protection for his house however, then concern would be not being able to retain sand in front of the wall
- his seawall submission discusses the effect of the wall stopping the sand being retained
- it is possible that bull kelp was removed by the pool during recent developments
- if the sand dunes are to be reinstated then vegetation needs to be widespread and large scale seaward and landward sides
- access along the beach is an issue especially at the end of the sea wall
- access at St. Clair is a potential hazard when there is not much sand as when tide is in people find it difficult to get off the beach and have to get wet. This is of particular concern for older people and people with pushchairs.
- formal recreation is an important attribute of this area
- the whole area is seen as a recreation package including the beach
- rubbish after rugby games is an issue
- railway is good as is of historical interest and provides an attraction would not want the track to go any closer to sand dunes as is heavy machinery
- Tomahawk potential to have increased use with improved water quality (and compounded with difficult car parking at St. Clair and St. Kilda) – the absence of lifesaving in the area will become a problem
- Lawyers Head note that closed road means less suicide however, need to open to vehicle use further along Drive – as this dissipates cars and also provides for people accessing the beach
- access for surfers is important this includes JWOD
- JWOD provides a great view of area from cars on wet days or for people that can't walk far.
- rubbish along JWOD is an issue
- Wall above the St. Clair pool the bulk of the residents wanted this clear and were also promised seating above the area. Wall is solid (a big topic of resentment) and no seating.
- car parking in the St. Clair area is an issue for residents on busy days
- placing of rubbish bins would have been better if located next to steps
- elevated area at St. Clair for car parking is good and could utilise raised bit of land straight behind car park for car parking (currently not being used)

- other side of existing wall at raised car park area is sunny and sheltered and often used by public
- shark sign on shark bell needs to be reinstated to stop people ringing for fun as not knowing what it is for
- the rocks up against the sea wall moved very quickly and are now on beach and a hazard for swimmers as people don't know where they are – needs ongoing remedial action
- storm water discharge still appears to be going onto beach 1) base of Cliffs Rd (through grills) and 2) second beach
- the storm water run-off aids erosion of sand
- public toilets in Esplanade area this is an issue now that area is more popular
- traffic flow is a problem
- values the beach and sand
- Ocean Beach Domain Board in 50's and 60's installed brush fencing (this may have been done by a volunteer)
- big rocks by pool has changed ability of the Esplanade area to retain sand
- good to have green area near car parks on Esplanade
- need another access at Moana Rua Road
- sand sausages were effective

# Meeting 3: Ocean Beach Domain Lease Occupiers

Date: 26 November 2008

Location: Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive)

Attendees:

- Pirates Rugby Football Club (Mark Howart & Chris Rowe)
- Tainui Sports Society (Bryan Taylor)
- Westpac Bowls Stadium (Bruce Hendry & Patrick O'Neil)
- Dunedin Rugby Club (John Kennedy)
- Hurricane Rodders (Brian Fitzpatrick)
- Te Whanau Arohanui Trust (Kerry Cameron & Chris Graham)
- Martin Thompson (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

# Absent:

• none

- Tainui Sports Society
- the track from St. Clair to St. Kilda is very popular
- would like the dunes to stay at the current height
- but would like to see sand dunes built up Moana Rua Road
- want area to be kept tidy
- area should be kept as a recreation hub
- design of Esplanade a mistake as the wall deflects sand away and then sometimes a lot of sand beneath wall
- the wall has redirected current surfers say there is a lot of sand off-shore
- dunes need to be brought back
- people used to park at St. Kilda and walk along to St. Clair and back closure of part of JWOD may have contributed to problems of congestion at St. Clair
- Pirates Rugby Football Club
- want to stay on grounds as they are great grounds as sand based
- not essential to be located on Domain but a lot invested in building etc.
- erosion issue does not directly impacted them
- erosion solution/s should maintain the natural look of the area as much as possible
- good to have track along dunes as a very popular place and great area to walk or run on
- golf club gets annoyed with runners on grounds so if any chance to get a path system around edge of golf course and then possibly coming back around the other side or track continue to Lawyers head and through to Tomahawk
- leases being short-term difficult to plan and spend money as no security
- JWOD being cut off has meant a lost asset for the city. If can't walk or not a nice day then people can park and look out at sea plantings may effect this use
- lease states that clubs have 3 months to move and there is no compensation and then land reverts to Council
- want to see good solid dunes safety first but needs to look natural
- if a combination of management options needed then should be a mixture of

structural and informal

- don't want to see a sea wall along the entire St. Clair to St. Kilda beach front
- the current situation is a great mixture of types of surfers/experiences JWOD / track / esplanade
- it is important to maintain a continuous access along beach i.e. maintain as a nice sandy walk along entire beach – people don't want to clamber over rocks and groynes – the ability of the uninterrupted walk is a big asset
- if a wider dune system is needed along the entire area to save the city then all users of the Domain may need to go – all leaseholders need to be aware of that
- <u>Westpac Bowls Stadium</u>
- \$6 million to replace
- not keen to move
- short-term lease is an issue
- security of dune system is important
- the temporary outfall pipe has changed the sand accumulation in the area
- can't encroach any more on dunes
- sand being put there is just being washed away
- if a break water type structure to stop waves then this could stop sand getting onto the beach
- Nussa has the same problem and regularly pumps sand onto the beach
- sand and shell from harbour dredge is very good material
- Dunedin Rugby Club
- grave concerns that there will be a big storm and this will erode the 3m gap between the cliff face and the rugby ground lights
- to return area to dune is a tall order
- once was 30m of sand in front of area
- now people walk on park as there is no track
- the track is an asset to the whole area
- would like to see the force of the waves stopped further out at sea (e.g. Break water) – rather than the shore taking the impact
- Hurricane Rodders
- lease holder concerns are minor as major concern is protection of houses
- not really affected as far away from issue
- the Club doesn't have to be located on the Domain but it is a central location close to the city. They have a social hall. Short-term lease is a problem
- For all clubs on the Domain the cost of moving would probably be the demise of the club
- <u>Te Whanau Arohanui Trust</u>
- their building is just about being washed away and this is a real concern
- this area is iconic to NZ important for formal recreation right by the beach and the casual recreational use of the area
- important it stays a recreational hub and access to the beach and walking through the dunes is important
- it is important location for Trust as what they are is part of the environment –

therapeutic – wouldn't be the same situated somewhere else

- Have been involved with many plantings and it is disheartening to see it all washed away
- vision for the area is a place full of people using it for recreating / the city protected / and stakeholders protected
- protection is important and what is decided must be effective would be good to have area natural – but in reality then if it needs to be a combination of hard and soft options then it has to be.

# Meeting 4: Ocean Beach Domain Lease Occupiers

Date: 27 November 2008

Location: Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive)

Attendees:

- East Otago Smallbore Rifle Association (Les Bell & Lindsay Horne)
- Otago Model Engineering Society (Andrew Harbrow, Jim Woods & Gary Douglas)
- St. Clair Tennis Assn (Justin Booth)
- Civil Service Harrier & Amateur Athletic Club (David Low)
- Greg Sligo (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

# Absent:

- Cornelius Mathias Ratten
- Richard Cathro
- Chisholm Park Golf Club

- East Otago Smallbore Rifle Association
- value of building is \$500,000 \$600,000
- concern regarding what may happen in the future as there is no security with the year by year lease
- need better parking facilities
- Otago Model Engineering
- value of premises more than \$1million
- want to develop area and move forward and the 1 year tenure is restrictive
- aspirations for a larger track that goes beyond their current grounds
- location on the Domain is important as a lot of foot traffic in area and people coming to beach and Domain have a package of fun family things to do
- OBD is a playground for the city
- 4,000 to 5,000 people per year visiting
- people need to be able to access beach in many areas this is important as people see the clubs located in the area and may investigate further
- near St. Clair Scouts stand of pines trees that are now all cut down. Trees add to the playground nature of the area.
- Would like to see the Domain more open to public so people have access through the Domain
- would like the lease changed that provides security with an out clause for Council that clubs have to move if area needed for erosion management measures
- even a letter to the clubs from Council explaining why a year to year lease and giving assurance that they will only be moved if area needed for management of erosion issues – this letter would make clubs more comfortable of Council's intentions
- to clear sites would be an issue for them and for other clubs would be a huge cost and the end of the club
- because of yearly leases clubs are not putting \$ into their facilities and the place will start to look shabby

- best sporting recreation hub special in New Zealand
- St. Clair Tennis
- need to resurface courts but can't apply for funding to do this as the club is only on a year to year lease
- the location of the Tennis club is important at it serves the local community.
- A strong club with a lot of young members
- trees next to court would be a problem if they dropped leaves
- <u>Harriers</u>
- more of a concern is what is happening to Tahuna Park
- the club owns the building and the location is ideal as it is central and it is also a great place to run from
- members run along the dunes
- natural track in area will be better than an extended esplanade
- club members are more into running along tracks than roads as more interesting – so track along dunes ideal
- value of long stretch of beach not interrupted with groynes etc.
- for runners and others the long beach is an attraction
- for runners increased access through the Domain would be excellent
- Brush scrub area near Kettle Park is used by Athletics Otago for a yearly cross country 1 <sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub> loop
- St. Clair Primary School use the area as well
- grants are needed for clubs to maintain facilities and they can't get the funding because no security of tenure
- the clubs present tended to agree that a letter from Council explaining the situation with regard to yearly leases would help them be able to obtain funding for maintenance etc.

# Meeting 5: St. Clair Esplanade Business Owners and Home Owners

Date: 1 December 2008

Location: Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive)

Attendees:

- Beverly Billyard
- Robert and Valerie Brown
- Greg Sligo (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

# Absent:

- Kushla Sullivan & Nick Dodds (Starfish Café)
- Sandy Kilgour & Lee Hastie (Esplanade Restaurant)
- Rod Rust and Katherine Greer
- Upavon Investments Ltd (apologies)
- Alex Aerakis (Salt Bar and Restaurant)
- Murray MacArthy

- sand on Ocean Beach comes and goes it is part of the natural process
- it has always done that and always will
- the big tides have more of an affect on the dunes
- maybe Roxburgh Dam has influenced sand available
- as a girl can't remember the Esplanade area of the beach being so rocky
- there should be a walkway along the whole length of Ocean Beach
- the track should be more formal like the existing track at the esplanade sea wall end
- this existing track is used a lot
- track is an asset to this area
- people use track when it is high tide or when the wind is really blowing
- the track is used a lot by residents
- a track from second beach to Tomahawk would be great
- the track should be accessible to wheelchairs and prams and also so runners can use it – so needs to fairly formal
- sand accumulates on the track at St. Clair needs to be regularly maintained to keep tidy
- priority is the value of the sand dunes to protect the city
- structures such as a wall will not be good for the aesthetics of the area i.e. change the appearance of the beach in a negative way
- but may be need to compromise to preserve role of area for coastal protection
- concerns regarding end of wall effect
- access points to the beach need to be in areas where people need to get on and off the beach – this is also from a safety perspective – so people don't get trapped on beach with incoming tide
- asset of beach is the long uninterrupted walk and view
- surfers need to be considered as important to this area so need to consider wave patterns
- sacrifices may need to be made

- sports fields at Kettle Park could be shifted over (as there is space there) and also there may be space at Tahuna Park
- access to Lawyers Head is important but realise there has been less suicide and more wildlife since closure – but this is a great place and also used to access beach – take tourists up there – important to have car access to memorial – whole encompassing view accessible for people who can't walk far – this is a spiritual type place – especially for people who love the sea
- the view of the length of beach from the St. Clair end has gone so now this view from Lawyers Head is important
- The access to the beach from JWOD is important as it distributes people along the beach

# Meeting 6: St. Clair Esplanade Business Owners and Home Owners

Date: 2 December 2008

Location: Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive)

Attendees:

- Steven Chittock (Swell Café, Esplanade Hotel and Apartments, and new developments along Esplanade)
- Greg Sligo (DCC)
- Dolina Lee (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

# Absent:

- Anderson Lloyd Trustees Company Ltd & Catherine Hamilton-Kerr
- Richard & Noellie Tapper & Russell Melville

- the current developments of Steve's along the Esplanade is to provide a health spa facility
- this involves heated pools and jets of salt water
- access to beach needs to be in relevant places
- need public input into planting so you get by-in from the community
- part of the attraction of Ocean Beach is the coastal environment and sea air and this ties in with health spa
- would like to see a coastal walkway from Tunnel Beach to Tomahawk Lagoon
- the track along Ocean Beach is important
- natural aesthetics for the area is important
- attraction of Dunedin is its diversity and the wilderness of Ocean Beach in the city is unique and an asset
- the Esplanade is good for all abilities
- a track along the whole foreshore would be a mixture of different surfaces and accessibility
- The closure of JWOD is depriving people of an asset
- it is important that people can drive along JWOD older people / all ability accessibility
- JWOD should form part of a longer track
- Ocean Beach is a natural wonder
- DCC acquisitions of land should focus on a track from Blackhead to Tomahawk Lagoon

# Meeting 7: Ocean Beach Home Owners

Date: 08 December 2008 Location: Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive)

Attendees:

- Peter Skegg
- Dolina Lee (DCC)
- Greg Sligo (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

# Absent:

- Fairbairn Geeves Properties Ltd
- Kevin and Rosemary Allison
- Spinoza Ltd
- Noelle Liddy
- Graham Bugler and Vanessa Cocks
- Andrew and Megan McPherson

- worst flood in area was through the railway tunnel
- people that can't walk have the Esplanade area to use i.e. wheelchairs/frames
- value the wilderness aspect of area and ability to walk dogs
- suicide from JWOD is an issue could use vegetation to stop this
- is a pity can't drive along JWOD but there is a wildlife element and can be used to exclude cars
- we don't want hundreds of people in the area
- use plantings to keep a wilderness feel to area
- maybe the track should be so you can push a chair along and if the Esplanade grows in popularity track will become more popular
- access to beach along the track is important
- it would be a great shame if any management options had a negative effect on the surf for surfers
- if there was no access or limited access then this would be a major issue for walkers
- wooden slats at access points don't work as not comfortable to walk on
- To be able to walk uninterrupted along this beach is a key asset
- highly desirable that the attractions in this area (including park and family attractions) remain that this Domain and beach is a family attraction.

# Meeting 8: Ocean Beach Domain Lease Occupiers

Date: 09 December 2008

Location: Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive)

Attendees:

- Martin Fastier (Kazbah formerly Lost Tribes)
- Paul Cadogan (Pirates Squash)
- Heather Cadogan (Pirates Squash)
- B.P. Williams (Badminton Hall)
- Baden French (Badminton Hall)
- Martin Thompson (DCC)
- Dolina Lee (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

# Absent:

- Tutuki Pai Ltd representatives
- Forbury Park Bowling Club
- Dunedin Ice Stadium (Neil Gamble)
- Seabreeze Cafe

- concerns regarding global warming and importance of dunes
- important that this area remains for recreation and is not changed to residential
- this area is a recreation hub
- JWOD access is important and this far end access (as with St. Kilda) is very important
- Middle Beach formal access should be eventually opened as people will access anywhere in this area and therefore contribute to erosion
- surfers must be considered when deciding on erosion mitigation measures
- landfill is inside of sand dunes Badminton Hall sits on part of the tip
- public access and bad behaviour is an issue between Ice Stadium and Badminton Hall
- clean sea water is a priority for this area
- important that the area keeps a wilderness nature ambience
- need more rubbish bins along track and at access points
- track from St. Clair to St. Kilda should remain a fairly informal
- the Domain and Beach should be open to all users we don't see this as a wildlife sanctuary – it is a city beach
- JWOD important as can view the sea from the car and from Lawyer's Head there is a great view
- walking and walking the dog is an important use along JWOD even in winter when it is twilight or dark no lighting in dog parks
- providing a range of surfaces along the foreshore is good
- if walkways in area improved or expanded then need formal lighting at night to act as a deterrent to bad behaviour
- natural look for this area is important
- Domain maps at strategic points of public access would be great showing accesses to beach / tracks / clubs

Badminton Hall:

- location is reasonably accessible for everyone central location
- capital investment
- owns land
- security is not the best as people 'hang out' in area

Pirates Squash:

- very close to town central although very underused people like this squash club because of other facilities close by e.g. one parent to squash and the other parent to the beach with the kids or to go to Esplanade for a beer afterwards.
- Parks popular

Kazbah:

- central position
- good car parking
### Meeting 9: Ocean Beach Domain Lease Occupiers

Date: 11 December 2008

Location: Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive)

Attendees:

- Andrew Robinson (Ocean Beach Railway)
- Campbell Thomson (Ocean Beach Railway)
- Bevan Moreton (Ocean Beach Scout Group)
- Arthur Bennett (Tainui Scout Group)
- Sue Smith (Tainui Scout Group)
- Hec Browett
- Kevin McRae (Scouting NZ)
- Stef Wade (St. Patricks Scout Group)
- David Jackson (Forbury Park Croquet)
- Ron McMurran (Forbury Park Croquet)
- Greg Sligo (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

Absent:

• Robert Munro

- <u>Scouting:</u>
- The locations of the scout groups is excellent as next to South Dunedin and an important catchment area for youth
- The location on the Domain next to the beach is great as scouting often works in the environment and understanding of the environment as part of their programs – the beach is a key resource by these groups – lessons include physical well-being / nature and the environment
- Scouting plays a lot of games outside use the beach and also the dunes, golf course and playing fields for games at dusk or in the dark and the beach (getting water without getting wet type activities)
- Esplanade is the formal part of Ocean Beach the rest of the area is better to be kept in a more wilderness state
- St. Kilda access to beach is important
- the movement throughout the Domain at the moment is sufficient wouldn't be good if movement through area was restricted.
- At Tainui access to beach is difficult ideal if there was an access to beach from this Lawyers Head end
- Croquet Club:
- location of the club is good as it is out of residential areas and therefore quieter
- it is an exposed site and while the sand ground is good for drainage it does also mean area needs to be watered more often
- providing shelter throughout Domain is important and around the club this would provide some shelter.
- Track between St. Clair and St. Kilda is a good asset in the area good for casual

walkers and runners

- sand blowing onto club and houses (at St. Clair Park) is an issue
- wouldn't like to see the area more developed with tar seal and buildings the beauty of the area is that it is far away from traffic
- Kettle Park is used frequently for athletic events by Otago Athletics and secondary schools for a mini cross-country circuit
- Railway:
- this is a heritage railway area and heritage locomotives
- location is important as it is close to the city and to other recreational activities e.g. Mini golf and model engineering
- this area is a recreational hub and public's use of railway etc. is part of a family day visit to beach/playground etc.
- vision of club is to extend the track as close as possible to St. Clair
- because of sports fields the track line went inland where the track needed to accommodate the Dunedin Stadium
- any buffer width of active sand dune needs to accommodate Elderly People Housing /Ice Stadium and Badminton Hall
- Railway has concerns over value of assets and wants to house them properly and also concerns over the cost to move their society locomotives / tracks, etc.
- their club complements the casual recreation opportunities of this recreation hub
- the area is a destination for people very different from if they were located out on their own
- the area also provides a possible destination for train riders St. Clair to St. Kilda or the other way
- the use of the club's private track line makes health and safety issues a lot easier as not having to work in areas where trains travel at higher speeds and trains other than their own i.e. the Ontrack Line
- enthusiasts visit the society but the area could become a lot more known to Dunedin residents if they could develop their grounds and facilities – they would like to open the area up more to the public
- not sure of the future and focus of members is less as future uncertain
- have plans for new buildings and to make the trains and experience for public more presentable and also to protect the fleet
- they have been told by the DCC in the past not to invest as security of tenure not known
- <u>General:</u>
- short-term lease for Croquet Club is an issue as the building needs painting and would like to build a new building
- JWOD and Lawyers Head is important for Dunedin eat lunch in car important views of the city
- would be good to have Second Beach linked in to any track/walking network
- recreation use of this area is very special for Dunedin residents Dunedin is probably the only city that has recreation facilities like the Domain, Ocean Beach and JWOD – so close to the city
- visual stretch of the beach is part of its beauty

- but most important is that people can have continuous movement through the beach – domain (i.e. avoid beach being broken up for erosion mitigation measures).
- The track between St. Clair and St. Kilda needs to be reinstalled as is an important facility in this area. Also important for use when beach is too windy for people
- The clubs that use this area are not in it for commercial gain (not a commercial identity) i.e. to remain effective and continue to do work "for the better good of the community" the Council has to recognise that their leases and rates are kept low.
- Important that Council is undertaking thorough research in finding best long-term solution a long-term strategy is good and keeping key stakeholders up-to-date of developments and why decisions are being made is very important
- aesthetics are important in this area hard fill looks terrible if hard options are decided then it needs to not look like things have just been dumped there
- if vegetation is to be planted then it needs to be in keeping with the coastal environment preferably native trees
- would be good to have a cycle link to land along Portsmouth Drive and the cycle lanes move through some of the Domain.
- Kids outgrow Marlow Park and cycle links to paths in this area for older children and adults would be great.
- Parking around Marlow Park is an issue since the closure of part of JWOD
- the clubs in this area would not survive if they had to operate on private land as would be too expensive
- Second Beach and Cargill's Castle could be included a great view from this area
- Note Jackie Fanning visited the Otago Railway and Locomotive Society separately and has notes from those meetings

### Meeting 10: Ocean Beach Surf Interests

Date:28 January 2009Location:St. Clair Surf Lifesaving Club Rooms

Attendees:

- Antony Mason (St. Clair Surf Lifesaving)
- Brett Hastie (South Coast Boardriders)
- Graham Carse (South Coast Boardriders)
- Greg Sligo (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

#### Absent:

- Peter Gibbons (St. Kilda Surf Lifesaving)
- Peter Haslemore (St. Clair Surf Lifesaving)
- Steve Bennett (St. Clair Esplanade Surf School)

- Brett showed video of wave action travelling along the sea wall during a time when swell was not big
- the problem of the sea wall is the curvature and the way the sections of the wall are stacked
- the previous sea wall caused waves to go in and out rather than along
- Antony the sidewards wave along wall is dangerous as it creates a rip to the north making it difficult for surfers and swimmers to get out of the water at high tide – this includes kids playing off the esplanade stairs
- also dangerous are the rocks that are exposed when the sand is out
- St. Clair Surf Lifesaving ramp is dangerous as when there is not much sand there is a drop-off and very difficult to get boats in and out – it would be better if the ramp went along the wall
- small recreational boat users use this ramp so this is a problem for them too.
- long-term planning should provide for a public boat ramp somewhere else for small boaters and jet skis (as current situation sometimes causes congestion and therefore issue for using life saving boats)
- this surf lifesaving ramp creates its own rip that doesn't help the erosion issue
- an extension to this ramp would be ideal maybe something that curves so not adding to wall rip
- a public boat ramp near pedestrian access at Lawyers Head would be a good place
  as this place can be sheltered and there is existing car parking there.
- any artificial underwater reef would not work in this situation unless it was very solid and anchored extremely well – as Ocean Beach experiences extreme conditions.
- Durban in South Africa and some places on the east coast of Australia experience similar conditions
- a groyne/breakwater would be great for surfing but the natural state of the beach and environs is a great thing about Ocean Beach and therefore aesthetics is important and a breakwater would ruin this. A selfish view of surfers would be to want a breakwater. Keeping Ocean Beach as natural as possible is important. Dunedin has many great surf breaks so really an artificial break structure is not

important.

- Antony there is a small safety issue to do with breakwaters but not significant
- Graham suggested stock piling the sand while there is a lot of it on the beach for times when not much
- Sea Wall better to have steps receding into wall the current steps are often not usable and also can get slippery
- important to have steps by scout hall near Middle Beach as current access are the wooden steps near St. Clair and then St. Kilda.
- when the sand is not there walking along the beach when tide is high is dangerous as lots of rubble and steel sticking out of sand
- having formal public access at Middle Beach is not a problem as people go there anyway. Signs explaining that Middle Beach is not a good place to swim because of rips would be beneficial
- the St. Clair Surf Lifesaving regularly move along the beach to this area to see if things are OK outside of the flags.
- St. Kilda Surf Lifesaving they have difficulties with soft sand getting their boats out they seem to cope with using wooden slat boards
- access along JWOD is important as there is sometimes a surf break off Lawyers Head. Access along JWOD is also important for other recreation such as running and walking. In a northeast swell this area is more protected.
- pollution is an issue for surfers/swimmers
- car access to car park at the top of Lawyers Head maybe not so important but walking access to the top of Lawyers Head should remain.
- suicide people are jumping off High Cliff while Lawyers Head is closed.
- the walking track from St. Clair to St. Kilda is a great asset in the area and is an alternative to the beach when tide is high important that walking access through dunes remains
- a track up to the top of Lawyers Head could be an extension of this incorporating JWOD). Good if for cyclists as well
- parking issues at St. Clair not enough space for people to come and look at the sea from their cars therefore JWOD is important for this purpose.
- at Esplanade some car parks have gone with the new configuration and also staff and users of café's and bars park here.
- there are no changing rooms for surfers so they use cars for this purpose.
- it is important that there is no limit on car parking as surfers use this and can often be out at sea for longer than 2 hours
- residents are starting to talk of requesting resident only car parking zones in nearby residential streets.
- important that existing green areas on the Esplanade remain aesthetics / open space values
- aesthetics of whole Ocean Beach area is to keep it looking as natural as possible the natural state of the beach and dunes so close to the city – is an enormous asset for Dunedin
- rubbish on beach / playground / esplanade is a problem need to have fines and patrolling
- camping in vans in Esplanade car parks occurs
- dogs on beach and around Esplanade least of worries often locals and often seen picking up other's rubbish

 need more rubbish bins – and cleared out more during busy times – although are done often – Perhaps two people employed to walk along beach/playground/esplanade every morning during busy periods – weekends/nice weather/holidays

#### Meeting 11: Victoria Park Home Owners Date:

2 February 2009

Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive) Location:

Attendees:

- Victoria Park Home Owners 3 people
- Greg Sligo (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

- plant shelter trees in dune system and on the Domain for shelter from wind • prefer native trees but anything that would work
- sand blows on properties in Victoria Park especially ones nearer the beach
- train line should be a cycle way as it is not often used
- others value trains nice to look at but should go all the way to St. Clair •
- walking track along the length of St. Kilda to St. Clair is an asset needs to have a • view though
- access at Moana Rua is important a lot of people heading down dune anywhere •
- JWOD should be opened this is a city asset should be accessible for walking • and cars – popular place for residents to take tourists – with outfall pipe line gate, the length of road available for public use is too short! JWOD - also important for residents for exercise, and the walk to Lawyers Head is the only available hill work for residents living on the flat.
- beach walking is an important activity however coastal protection is important • and what ever needs to be done should be done to protect South Dunedin
- protection of houses is important •
- it is also important that Domain remains a hub for recreation this adds to the vibrancy of the area – lots of people around is great
- not concerned about maintaining a wilderness look need to increase café scene and activities for people – like at St. Clair

## Meeting 12: Victoria Park Home Owners

3 February 2009

Location: Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive)

Attendees:

Date:

- Victoria Park Home Owners 2 people
- Greg Sligo (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

- JWOD should remain open this is popular for walking
- the continuation of the track from St. Clair to St. Kilda and then JWOD is a great varied, interesting, scenic and relatively long walk
- area near St. Clair Tennis courts looks rough broad leafs / scrub / wall deteriorating
- a lot of bottle and glass along Victoria Rd
- there are enough access points to the beach when Moana Rua access is open
- the Marlow Park playground is a great asset good vibrancy
- railway is very untidy / scrap iron rusting / the movement of trains is OK
- lots of rabbits in the area
- the value of this area is not only the beach but the recreation facilities golf / bowls / fields for walking the dogs
- a natural looking dune system along all of the beach would be preferable
- Lawyers Head is a good attraction for tourists maybe closed at night as boy racers are a problem – where gate is now is ideal as there is still space for cars to look at the sea
- a few people jump from Lawyers Head however, so many people get benefit from the views and space from there
- bad smell at Lawyers Head sometimes
- the angle of the greens at golf holes 16 and 18 has become greater over the years
- there is an underground river that runs through the golf course near JWOD and comes out at Lawyers Head on the Tomahawk side
- the water table in this area is only ~1m

## Meeting 13: Victoria Park Home Owners

4 February 2009

Location: Pirates Rugby Clubrooms (John Wilson Ocean Drive)

Attendees:

Date:

- Victoria Park Home Owners 3 people
- Greg Sligo (DCC)
- Jackie Fanning (L&R NZ)

- protection of assets is very important
- would be good to extend locomotive all the way to Lawyers Head along JWOD
- need to promote all assets of this area under one umbrella incl. cafés thus maximising publicity
- significant increase in boy racer culture over the years
- car traffic in the area should be slowed down and discouraged and foot traffic encouraged
- easier access to the beach is important the steep accesses and wooden slats are very difficult to walk on – steps are a lot easier
- beach access needs to be restricted to certain locations (don't need any more)
- locomotive area looks very messy if people complain about noise then trees should be planted
- JWOD is a very important asset Lawyers Head should have a café
- JWOD traffic calming 'islands' to slow boy racers
- residents take visitors to Lawyers Head
- the Domain is a recreation hub and a great asset
- JWOD well used by people for eating lunch/dinner from the car
- walking track from St. Clair to St. Kilda was good and well used want this to return
- Train to St. Clair would be an asset
- since JWOD has been closed the presence of boy racers on Victoria Rd has got worse

### **APPENDIX 3 : DIRECT CONSULTATION MINUTES**

Meeting Minutes: Key Stakeholder Meetings Re: Ocean Beach Long-Term Planning Process

# **Direct Consultation : Chisholm Golf Club** (Andrew Wighly)

Date: Location: 10 February 2009 Chisholm Golf Club

Details:

- since JWOD has been closed the upkeep of the golf course has been a lot easier and there has been less vandalism to clubrooms etc.
- problems from JWOD include: stealing of green flags (up to 55 a year) / vandalism of rubbish bins on golf course / cars coming off the road (average of about 3 a year) / rubbish on course (this includes the seagulls dropping cartoons of left fast food on golf course to break open to eat)
- people being able to access JWOD is good economically for the golf club as many people (including visitors to Dunedin) decide to play golf after seeing the course and views.
- the track through the golf course is problematic as some people walking/running/mountain biking/ dog walking - do not always wait for golfers to finishes hitting the ball before crossing the fairway.
- the golf club doesn't mind most people using the course track but it is a potentially dangerous situation
- management are not keen to have a more publicised or another track through the course
- even if track was to run along edge of course it would need to cross course somewhere if it was to continue through cemetery to Tomahawk
- feel that better signage is needed so people understand that they need to give way to golfers and of potential danger along some fairways you cannot see if people are using the track until they are in a potentially dangerous situation
- boy racers are the main problem along JWOD and speed bumps are too far apart to be any deterrent
- would be great to stop all vehicle access along the road perhaps can move gate further along to make more room for cars parking and viewing sea.
- walking access only would be good or closing car access in evenings
- there is no problem with earth movement/slumping from JWOD

## Direct Consultation : DCC City Property (Sharron Tipa)

Date:	10 February 2009
Location:	Municipal Chambers

Details:

- there are approx. 50 flats in the elderly peoples housing (EPH)
- there are never empty units as they are very popular the surrounding area is flat
- people in these units are 55 years or older
- key issues for City Property is that they be kept informed of the progress so they can inform tenants

- if housing needs to be removed this would impact significantly on the Dunedin EPH portfolio – there are not empty flats elsewhere to accommodate people
- any replacement units would need to be provided on a similar site i.e. flat / close to amenities
- City Property has no long-term plans to modify area i.e. status quo

Direct Consultation :	DCC Community and Recreation Department – Sports Grounds (Harold Driver)
Date:	13 <sup>th</sup> February 2009
Location:	Civic Centre - 6 <sup>th</sup> Floor

Details:

- Kettle Park
- Melchester Rovers use the 3 junior soccer fields they say the value of the site is that it is close to South Dunedin - a lower socio-economic area
- Rugby grounds used by Dunedin Rugby as home ground / cross country / Saturday competition, and other rugby groups
- all fields are well used
- soccer grounds 1 and 2 are used by school groups / Dunedin Tech Soccer and Melchester Rovers
- consultants are currently being commissioned to assess whether the use of all the sports fields can be accommodated/transferred to other existing sports grounds in Dunedin
- there are a number of possible changes that could be made to other areas of the • Domain – e.g. Multi-purpose turf field/s where existing Marlow Park Car Park is (beside Moana Rua Rd)
- main issue with sports fields on Domain is wind blown sand especially Kettle Park
- the track along the top of the dune (which is now closed) does not negatively affect fields (e.g. compacting turf)
- now track is closed people walk on the field still no conflict as when people are playing, walkers avoid going onto field (this is only Rugby Field 1 as it is close to dune face)
- no major settling issue of the underground fill collapsing (as with other fields such • as Opoho) as likely to be different type of fill (i.e. not cars etc.)

<b>Direct Consultation :</b>	DCC Waste and Water (Ian Satterthwaite and John Mackie)
Date:	13 <sup>th</sup> February 2009
Location:	Civic Centre - <sup>1st</sup> Floor

Details:

- when the construction ramp was built through dune to the outfall construction pipe - only clean fill was found
- Resource Consent requires that the construction site is returned to original state
- ORC also provided map of a disposal area near St Kilda on JWOD
- Stage 2 Tahuna Upgrade is all onshore work at treatment station this upgrade • will not impact further towards the dunes than existing site.

- however Waste and Water have a designated boundary further towards Tahuna Park than what is currently used by Waste and Water – they have permission to use as much as they need within this boundary – what is not used will be returned to CARS to administer
- however, given the land requirements for options under consideration it is unlikely that there will be any residual designated area returned to CARS

#### Direct Consultation : Keren Skegg (University of Otago – Department of Psychological Medicine – Dunedin School of Medicine) Date: 17 February 2009

Date:	17 February 200
Location:	Phone Interview

Details:

- has completed her study of suicide and call-outs at Lawyers Head comparing 10 years prior to closure of JWOD and 2 years that road has been closed
- 13 deaths in 10 years prior and no deaths afterwards (one woman jumped and survived)
- an average of 19.3 call-outs per year prior and 9.5 per year during 2 year study
- Keren has no knowledge of other suicides by jumping in Dunedin during this time
- the gate is a more important deterrent than the presence of a guard although the presence of a guard may have prevented some potential jumpers
- the guard did on occasions ring the police
- the position of the gate should remain where it is it is unknown how far from Lawyer's Head the gate needs to be to be an effective deterrent.
- if can't deny people access along JWOD then the next best restriction would be pedestrian access during the day only as walking to a destination may give people contemplating suicide time to reconsider
- means restriction is the most evidence based method of reducing suicide

Direct Consultation :	Steve Prescott (DCC Aquatic Services)
Date:	23 February 2009
Location:	St Clair Hot Salt Water Pool

Details:

- there is some talk of installing a dome over the pool so the pool can become an allyear facility – the potential concern with this development is that it may very well detract from the seaside / open air experience that is a draw card for many
- the Domain area should become a hub for casual recreation this includes facilities and shops that enhance this
- the train system should be developed as an attraction to encourage people to this area and as a way people can move through the reserve
- formal sports grounds and facilities don't need to be in area and use should be transferred
- train would be a tourist attraction for the area
- the hub of children's activities at St Kilda should stay
- would be good to have more attractions in area for city residents and tourists

- the natural beauty of the area from the beach is important as is the ability to walk uninterrupted along the entire Ocean Beach
- informal recreation e.g. tracks could be developed in areas where now sports fields and incorporated into erosion management options
- many people use the track from St. Clair to St. Kilda this is an important alternative to beach (high tide and during stormy conditions)
- tracks should be for walkers only
- a car free Esplanade would be great

Direct Consultation :	<b>Dunedin Ice Stadium</b> (Neil Gamble and Treasurer)
Date:	7 March 2009
Location:	Dunedin Ice Stadium

Details:

- the provision of other recreation opportunities in the vicinity does not really affect business although some parents leave children at Stadium and then go to St. Clair Esplanade for dinner or drink
- Stadium and Tahuna Holiday Park have a good relationship Park sponsors some activities and the Stadium use the camp grounds for visitors during events
- majority of customers using the Ice Stadium are not from neighbouring South Dunedin
- 59% of users are from the more affluent suburbs such as Andy Bay / Tainui / St. Clair / Mornington / Belleknowes
- Not concerned about sand issue even if sand dunes reinstated in area as the Stadium is high enough that sand will not collect in gutters etc.
- Car park in front of the Stadium is an issue as tenants (indoor bowls) and neighbouring Badminton Hall use it for their car parking the public see a full car park and think Stadium is busy and therefore don't come in. Need signage to say it is for Ice Stadium customers only.
- Big adjacent car park (Marlow Car park) has benefits to Ice Stadium this car park is full when there is the annual Ice Show or Tournaments (even overflow to Forbury). ACC use this area for motorbike training and Ice Stadium arrange to provide food. Marching and miniature car racing also use this car park and use the Stadium's facilities.

### Direct Consultation : Otago Railway and Locomotive Society (Campbell

	Thompson / Andrew Robinson)
Date:	17 <sup>th</sup> November 2008
Location:	Otago Railway and Locomotive Society

- There was originally a branch line out to this area overtime the tracks were ripped up.
- OBR&L first heritage railway and only one where society owns all assets
- difficult to put a value on items as historic
- The OBDB encouraged the formation of the line from the current location to St Clair – to run along the Barracks then onto Victoria Rd

- line then had to make a big curve due to the extension of the stadium
- the Domain Board suggested on top of the dunes and until 1989 the track ran along the top of the dunes to half way along the second field at Kettle Park
- In 1989, the Council (without consultation) lifted nearly all of the line along Kettle Park and dumped rubble on it – to attempt to mitigate erosion
- they stated that there used to be a carpark out from beginning of Kettle Park
- over the years there has been much discussion between the Council and the Society of what to do at this site and suggesting other sites
- from a business perspective it has stalled progress as they cannot plan no development as no security of tenure
- ~ 6,000 visitors a year some of whom come to Dunedin especially to look at specific trains
- \$14,000 financial statements available
- location is important as already have sheds and railway if there was a viable alternative then would move
- it would be very expensive to move all equipment/facilities and trains
- this location is good as it is flat and a place with tourists and recreation
- future development options could include going through Hancock Park and road side of golf course
- a southern route depends on erosion mitigation measures
- if Council uses Kettle Park as part of erosion mitigation then the Society tracks could be incorporated into this alignment and placement of tracks is not critical
- benefits of track continuing south is that it is scenic and more of a destination to head to and from St Clair
- 2 building projects planned:
- one is a Running Shed (for operational trains) this would be included in a visitor experience of the site (making the experience more than a train ride but a heritage experience too). This area will not be a workshop and therefore will be clean and tidy – have ability for people to walk under train)
- the Running Shed is planned for the area beside track and at base of sports field/end of fence line with Marlow Park
- existing workshop is not visitor friendly
- second building plan is purely for storage and would be an extension of the existing carriage shed (this is so all trains can be put inside – an important consideration in the coastal environment)
- funding for developments would not be a problem as funders are encouraging Society to apply and they have a good case (as NZ heritage value)
- both new buildings would be relocatable

Direct Consultation :	Otago Model Engineering Society (James Wood (Sec) and
	Andrew Harbrow)
Date:	18 <sup>th</sup> November 2008
Location:	Otago Model Engineering Society

- believe that public access across beach and dune is important / important that it is a place for families to recreate
- would like to see public access across the whole reserve

- negative comments about Otago Railway and Locomotive Society but then would like to expand into their space
- Their facility is very popular with bookings 12 months in advance every weekend over summer they have children's birthday parties and now starting to open two Sundays a month (instead of one)
- established 1948
- believe that beach access and aesthetics are important as people come to the area for beach experience and tie it in with ice-cream/playground/and visit to model engineering facility.
- Would like to see more trees in area
- there used to be macrocarpa trees in area including on top of sand dunes
- Ice Stadium used to be a refuse tip
- important place for families
- (talked about wanting to expand into Otago Railway site and Marlow Park so it becomes open to the public) similar to what exists in Halswell Park, Christchurch
- tenure undermined as increase in rates and decrease in lease term (now year to year)

#### **APPENDIX 4 : CORRESPONDENCE WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSERVATION**



Jeff Connell Regional Conservator Otago Conservancy P.O. Box 5244 Dunedin 9016

26 January 2009

Dear Jeff,

#### **Ocean Beach Domain**

L&R New Zealand Ltd has been contracted by the Dunedin City Council to consult with key stakeholders regarding erosion at Ocean Beach and the potential options to mitigate this problem.

In February 2008, Marian Joyce van der Goes (DOC, Community Relations Manager) provided feedback on the proposed data collection for Ocean Beach (refer to attached). This letter is, in part, a response to that submission.

The DCC are aware there are legislation considerations applicable to this area, and that DOC administer a strip of Crown Land around Lawyers Head. The DCC will continue to consult with the Otago Conservancy throughout this Ocean Beach erosion mitigation process.

As part of the data collection process, DCC have contracted Spiralis Ltd to undertake an ecological assessment of the Ocean Beach area. In addition, hydrodynamic modelling is about to be undertaken, and this includes: Shoreline Modelling, Wave Refraction and Sediment Transport Modelling.

As stated in the above mentioned submission from DOC, wildlife activity at the northern end of Ocean Beach has increased since vehicle access along John Wilson Ocean Drive was temporarily restricted. As you will be aware, Ocean Beach is Dunedin's main city beach – not only for residents of neighbouring suburbs but regularly used by people of greater Dunedin. Various recreation uses include walking along the length of the beach (including dog walking) and use of John Wilson Ocean Drive to access Lawyers Head and the beach. Popular use of John Wilson Ocean Drive is to view the sea from a vehicle (an important passive recreational opportunity for those with limited time, reduced mobility, and an option on a stormy day).

As part of our consultation with key stakeholders regarding erosion issues at Ocean Beach, we seek a statement of opinion from the Otago Conservancy regarding the particular issue of future public access at Ocean Beach, given the area has both high recreational use and presence of wildlife. Considerations include the strategic importance of Ocean Beach as a wildlife habitat within the Otago coastal region. Should Ocean Beach remain a place where the public have unrestricted access, recognising that there are a number of beaches within greater Dunedin that have high ecological values and restricted public access?

L&R New Zealand Ltd has a deadline of mid-march to provide feedback to the DCC – we therefore would appreciate a response from your conservancy within this time frame.

Yours sincerely,

Department of Conservation Te Papa Atawhai

Masse fol . . . f. 16 to 546.02-21

26 February 2009

Jackie Fanning L&R New Zealand Ltd PO Box 35 Waitati Dunedin 4069

Dear Jackie

#### **Ocean Beach Domain**

Thank you for consulting with the Department about the ongoing management of

Like all Otago beaches, Ocean Beach provides habitat for indigenous wildlife. As the Department stated in its previous submission, the open sandy beach and dunes during the period it was closed to public access, has provided habitat for both sea lions and breeding oyster catchers. Both species are generally intolerant of disturbance by humans. Sea lions will express their intolerance by abandoning the area, whilst the breeding success of oyster catchers will be adversely affected.

Lawyers Head provides breeding habitat for red-billed gulls and white fronted terns (both threatened with extinction and ranked as being in gradual decline) and also spotted shags. The successful pingao plantings established by the Dunedin City Council and the coastal turfs on Lawyers Head also contribute to the ecological significance of this eastern end of Ocean Beach. There is also occasional use of this area by both yellow-eyed and little blue penguins.

With the appropriate management wildlife and its habitat at the eastern section of Ocean Beach (between the outfall pier to and including Lawyers Head) can continue to contribute to Dunedin's reputation as New Zealand's wildlife capital. proximity of this area to the city and current opportunity to plan for the future use of this area contributes to the area's significance. The Department therefore recommends that the Councils management focus be on recreational opportunities that do not directly conflict with wildlife and habitat values.

The Department considers that unrestricted public use of the eastern section of Ocean Beach will have an adverse affect on indigenous fauna and flora. Therefore, the Department recommends that council considers restricting or prohibiting dog access to this area and also prohibiting vehicles on the beach and dune areas. Fishing off Lawyers Head may adversely affect nesting birds, therefore Council may wish to consider identifying areas where fishing is and isn't allowed (i.e. directly above bird nesting sites). The Department could assist in identifying such areas. Finally Council may wish to consider installing signage in this section of Ocean Beach to highlight

#### Otago Conservancy

PO Box 5244, Moray Place, Dunedin 9058, New Zealand Telephone 03-477 0677, Fax 03-477 8626, www.doc.govt.nz both the values in the area and ways of avoiding adverse effects on both significant indigenous flora and fauna.

Thank you again for providing this opportunity to comment.

Yours sincerely,

Ken Stewart Acting Community Relations Manager

Otago Conservancy

Dense Stands

The environment council is 100 per form the environment of the basic process with the second states which as it's the presence in the second is pair (one uniterated on the open where it and the second states which are the presence of the second is pair (one uniterated on the open where it's and the second states which are the presence of the second on the presence are presention in the test are set of and the second state is the presence of the second on the presence are presention in the test are set of and the second state in the test are presented in the second of the second of the second is the second of the second state in the test are presented in the second of the second of the second of the second of the second state in the test are presented in the second of t

Arrish dimentation were den breeding file in or red-billed gulls and which firmled terms arrish dimentated with contraction and maked as being in contant decrine) and also protect and the (contain much or for terms lifed also contribute to the Contain City of militance of the (contain much or for term lifed also contribute to the conjust on arrish term submourser and the other and the decrine firms to protect and the arrish term terms and the second term of the second term of the contains of the second term of the second term and the second term firms to protect and the arrish term submourser and the other and the second term of the second term of the second terms of the second term of the second term of the second term of the second term of the arres in terms and terms are and the second terms of the second term of the second terms of the arres in terms and terms are and the second terms of the second terms of the second terms of the arres in terms and terms are and the second terms of the second terms of the second terms of the arres in terms and terms are and the second terms of the second terms of the second terms of the arres in terms and terms are and the second terms of the second terms of the second terms of the arres in terms are arrest and the second terms are arrest to be arrest and the second terms of the arrest second terms are arrest and the second terms are arrest and terms are arrest and the arrest second terms are arrest are arrest are arrest arrest are arrest arrest are arrest arrest are arrest arrest are arrest arrest are arrest arrest arrest arrest arrest arrest arrest arrest

petrick was have adding to be presented and the second state of the second

The contrary of this area to the city in a contrary of the city of

An extended of the second second state of the second second second second second second second of the second secon

Otago Conservancy PO Box 5244, Moray Place, Dunedin 9058, New Zealand Telephone 03-477 0677, Fax 03-477 8626, www.doc.govt.nz